

ULSTER COUNTY INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT AGENCY
-----X

PUBLIC HEARING

RE: UNIFORM TAX EXEMPTION POLICY

-----X
Legislative Chambers of the
County Legislature, 6th Floor
244 Fair Street
Kingston, New York

December 5, 2016
7:00 p.m.

BEFORE: MICHAEL HORODYSKI,
The Chair

A P P E A R A N C E S :

Michael Horodyski, The Chair

John Morrow, Vice Chair

Randall Leverette, Board Member

A. Joseph Scott, Esq., UCIDA Counsel

STAFF:

Suzanne Holt

Chris Fury

ALSO PRESENT:

Jim Maloney, Ulster County Legislator

Neil Bettez, Supervisor, Town of New Paltz

Two members of the Public

Two members of the Press

Reported by:
Kari L. Reed

1 Proceedings - 12/5/16

2 THE CHAIR: Okay, we are going to get
3 started.

4 Good evening. My name is Michael
5 Horodyski and I am the Chairman of the Ulster
6 County Development Agency. I would like to take
7 this opportunity to introduce you to John Morrow,
8 our Vice Chair, and Randall Leverett, a board
9 member, also members of the agency.

10 This evening we are holding a public
11 hearing to solicit comments to the Agency's
12 Uniform Tax Exemption Policy and certain other
13 policies of the agency. The purpose of this
14 public hearing is to provide the public with the
15 opportunity to submit comments to the Agency on
16 the Uniform Tax Exemption Policy, the PILOT
17 matrix, the Uniform Criteria for the Evaluation of
18 Projects, and the Local Labor Policy (the Agency's
19 policies). The comments received today at this
20 public hearing will be presented to the members of
21 the Ulster County Industrial Development Agency at
22 their next meeting. The next meeting of the
23 Ulster County Industrial Development Agency is
24 December 14th, 2016, at eight a.m. And, like all
25 meetings of the Agency, it is a meeting that is

1 Proceedings - 12/5/16

2 open to the general public.

3 We have made arrangements for a
4 stenographer to be present in order to accurately
5 make a record of public comments.

6 Again, the purpose of this hearing is to
7 solicit public comments on the Agency's policies.
8 The purpose of this hearing is not to discuss
9 local planning or zoning issues, or to debate the
10 general concept of whether the Agency should
11 provide tax incentives in connection with the
12 promotion of economic development in Ulster
13 County. The purpose is to discuss the specific
14 terms contained in the Agency's policies.

15 Further, we are not here to answer
16 questions; although, in the course of the hearing
17 we will consider questions if we have the
18 information to answer the questions and there is
19 sufficient time to consider such questions. We
20 have made arrangements to have the staff and
21 counsel of the Agency attend this hearing to be
22 available to answer questions if there is
23 sufficient time.

24 By way of background, copies of the
25 public hearing notice are available on the table

1 Proceedings - 12/5/16

2 with Chris. The notice was published in the Daily
3 Freeman. In addition, we sent copies of the
4 notice to the chief executive officer of each
5 village, town and school district in Ulster
6 County, and also to the County Executive of Ulster
7 County.

8 By way of operating rules, I would ask
9 that if you wish to make a public comment, please
10 raise your hand, approach the podium, and I will
11 call on you, and identify yourself for the record
12 and then make your comment. I ask that you keep
13 your comments to no more than five minutes.

14 Now, before formally beginning the public
15 hearing, I am going to suggest waiving the full
16 reading of the public hearing notice, unless there
17 is any objection, and instead request that the
18 full text be inserted into the public record.

19 (No response.)

20 THE CHAIR: And we will now open the
21 hearing at 7:02 for comments.

22 Neil.

23 MR. BETTEZ: Thank you for having this.
24 I know that -- I'd also like to -- I'm wondering
25 if we're going to be able to provide written

1 Proceedings - 12/5/16

2 comments. The Town Board would like to.

3 THE CHAIR: You're going to hear, as this
4 concludes, we are going to take written comments
5 up through December 9th, so this Friday.

6 MR. BETTEZ: Wow, that's fast. Okay.

7 THE CHAIR: It's been out there a while.

8 MR. BETTEZ: Yeah, no, I understand.

9 So I'm glad to see that, you know,
10 category five is still being discussed. You know
11 that it's a very controversial topic in New Paltz,
12 and so we have a lot of things to say about it. I
13 think the Town Board is going to be discussing it
14 some more.

15 It's very touchy. You know, the last
16 project that was proposed there were, you know,
17 different estimates for how much the costs for the
18 municipality would be versus the PILOT payments.
19 And, you know, so one of the concerns is that, you
20 know, the taxpayers would end up subsidizing this
21 when the benefits were spread throughout, you
22 know, the entire county.

23 We are interested in discussing the
24 payments. One idea would be a deviated PILOT
25 instead of a standard PILOT, so that we can make

1 Proceedings - 12/5/16

2 sure that the costs are fully covered for the
3 municipalities.

4 You know, the big concern that we have is
5 even under the highest -- you know, you've changed
6 some of the payments for the category five
7 currently. And when we just do like a calculation
8 for what we thought our costs were going to be for
9 Wilmore, even under the highest payment option we
10 still come up a little bit short for the costs.
11 So that's one of the suggestions that we have, a
12 deviated PILOT instead of a standard PILOT.

13 The other idea would be that this may be
14 a standard way to calculate those costs before the
15 projects are even proposed, because it seems like
16 now we end up talking about the merits of an
17 individual project. And those calculations for
18 what our costs versus our benefits would be might
19 change wildly, depending on how favorable people
20 look on each individual project. So we may
21 alleviate some of the arguments if we agree ahead
22 of time what those costs would be. And then we
23 could --

24 THE CHAIR: Just remember, though, in New
25 Paltz it wasn't cost, it was assessed value. That

1 Proceedings - 12/5/16

2 was the driver.

3 MR. BETTEZ: So, you know, also we're not
4 opposed to -- myself, we are not opposed to, you
5 know, having projects like this in New Paltz. We
6 just wanted to make sure that the taxpayers don't
7 have to bear the burden for the project.

8 So that's it. But we'll be submitting
9 written comments.

10 THE CHAIR: We knew this was obviously a
11 hot topic in New Paltz and we expected certainly
12 to get some comments from you guys, so.

13 MR. BETTEZ: And we appreciate your
14 working with us on it. So thank you.

15 THE CHAIR: Getty?

16 MALE SPEAKER: I don't have any comments,
17 Mr. Chairman. I was just given a paper to sign.

18 THE CHAIR: Okay, no problem.

19 Mr. Jim Maloney.

20 MR. MALONEY: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I
21 appreciate the time to be here to speak.

22 Hi. My name is Jim Maloney. I am
23 chairman of the Economic Development, Tourism and
24 Transportation Committee. I am an Ulster County
25 Legislator. I'm also the assessor for the Town of

1 Proceedings - 12/5/16

2 Ulster.

3 And I want to again commend the IDA for
4 taking this issue up. I fully understand, after
5 the last go-round in New Paltz, which Mr. -- I
6 believe Supervisor --

7 MR. BETTEZ: Yes.

8 MR. MALONEY: Yes. Described that there
9 is a new facet to it, that you do now contact the
10 local municipalities and seek their inputs, which
11 I think is a very, very positive evolvement in
12 this process. I look up and down the landscape in
13 the Town of Ulster, and believe me, some of the
14 most beautiful new buildings were done with the
15 assistance of the IDA.

16 Everyone looks and they think it's a
17 gift. It is not a gift. The Kirchhoff Medical
18 Building pays four dollars per square foot, which
19 is probably one of the highest taxes per square
20 foot in the Town of Ulster. So that, you know, if
21 anyone thinks it's a gift, it's not a gift. It's
22 assistance.

23 And you need that assistance in this
24 world to compete. And everyone should, you know,
25 know it's just -- it affects three taxing

1 Proceedings - 12/5/16

2 jurisdictions. I have some other people here that
3 it does not affect special districts, it does not
4 affect fire districts. They pay full value.

5 But again, thank you.

6 THE CHAIR: Thanks, Jim as always.

7 Anyone else?

8 (No response)

9 THE CHAIR: We're going to, just in the
10 event that somebody comes, I think it's about
11 7:07, so we'll keep this open until at least 7:20.
12 But I think in the meantime, Madam Stenographer,
13 we'll just take a brief pause.

14 (Recess taken from 7:07 p.m. to 7:15
15 p.m.)

16 THE CHAIR: We're going to go back on the
17 record quickly.

18 One thing that we removed from the
19 proposed UTEP, our Uniform Tax Exemption Policy
20 matrix, was workforce housing. And what I think
21 we're going to end up doing, based on some
22 comments we received only verbally, nothing
23 written yet, which we are hoping to get, is to
24 bring workforce housing back into an eligible
25 category under educational and workforce

1 Proceedings - 12/5/16
2 investment under our policy matrix. So that
3 bottom corner under the proposed is vacant as we
4 sit at this meeting. The expectation is that will
5 be repopulated with what was there in regards to
6 workforce housing.

7 Sorry.

8 (Recess taken from 7:16 p.m. to 7:20
9 p.m.).

10 THE CHAIR: We're going to go back on the
11 record at 7:20.

12 Again, is anybody else looking to speak?
13 We're happy to have you.

14 (No response.)

15 THE CHAIR: If not, I do want to note
16 that the Agency did receive written comments from
17 the Ellenville Central School District. And just
18 a quick synopsis of those comments were to include
19 the school district in any and all PILOT
20 discussions, and also provide them with UCIDA
21 rules when they're done. So those written
22 comments will be added to the public comments
23 received this evening and become part of the
24 public record.

25 In addition, the Agency will keep the

1 Proceedings - 12/5/16

2 period for the receipt of comments open until
3 December 30th, 2016. That's basically the last
4 business day of the year. So if you or anyone
5 that did not have the opportunity to attend this
6 hearing, please send us your comments to the
7 Agency at the address noted in the published
8 hearing notice. We will include those written
9 comments in the public record.

10 So if there are no further comments?

11 (No response)

12 THE CHAIR: I'm going to now close the
13 public hearing at 7:21. Thank you for attending.

14 (Time noted: 7:21 p.m.)

15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings - 12/5/16

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK)
) SS:
COUNTY OF DUTCHESS)

I, KARI L. REED, a Registered Professional Reporter (Stenotype) and Notary Public with and for the State of New York, do hereby certify:

I reported the proceedings in the within-entitled matter and that the within transcript is a true record of such proceedings.

I further certify that I am not related, by blood or marriage, to any of the parties in this matter and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 9th day of December, 2016.

Kari L. Reed

KARI L. REED

	10:21	change (1) 7:19		Evaluation (1) 3:17
A	basically (1) 12:3	changed (1) 7:5	D	even (3) 7:5,9,15
able (1) 5:25	bear (1) 8:7	chief (1) 5:4	Daily (1) 5:2	evening (3) 3:4,10;11:23
accurately (1) 4:4	beautiful (1) 9:14	Chris (1) 5:2	day (1) 12:4	event (1) 10:10
added (1) 11:22	become (1) 11:23	close (1) 12:12	debate (1) 4:9	Everyone (2) 9:16,24
addition (2) 5:3;11:25	beginning (1) 5:14	commend (1) 9:3	December (3) 3:24;6:5;12:3	evolution (1) 9:11
address (1) 12:7	benefits (2) 6:21;7:18	comment (2) 5:9,12	depending (1) 7:19	executive (2) 5:4,6
affect (2) 10:3,4	BETTEZ (6) 5:23;6:6,8;8:3,13;	comments (21) 3:11,15,19;4:5,7;	Described (1) 9:8	Exemption (3) 3:12,16;10:19
affects (1) 9:25	big (1) 7:4	5:13,21;6:2,4;8:9,12,	Development (5) 3:6,21,23;4:12;	expectation (1) 11:4
Again (4) 4:6;9:3;10:5;11:12	bit (1) 7:10	16;10:22;11:16,18,	8:23	expected (1) 8:11
Agency (12) 3:6,9,13,15,21,23,	board (3) 3:8;6:2,13	22,22;12:2,6,9,10	deviated (2) 6:24;7:12	F
Agency's (4) 3:11,18;4:7,14	bottom (1) 11:3	Committee (1) 8:24	different (1) 6:17	facet (1) 9:9
agree (1) 7:21	brief (1) 10:13	compete (1) 9:24	discuss (2) 4:8,13	fast (1) 6:6
ahead (1) 7:21	bring (1) 10:24	concept (1) 4:10	discussed (1) 6:10	favorable (1) 7:19
alleviate (1) 7:21	Building (1) 9:18	concern (1) 7:4	discussing (2) 6:13,23	fire (1) 10:4
although (1) 4:16	buildings (1) 9:14	concerns (1) 6:19	discussions (1) 11:20	five (3) 5:13;6:10;7:6
always (1) 10:6	burden (1) 8:7	concludes (1) 6:4	district (3) 5:5;11:17,19	foot (2) 9:18,20
appreciate (2) 8:13,21	business (1) 12:4	connection (1) 4:11	districts (2) 10:3,4	formally (1) 5:14
approach (1) 5:10	C	consider (2) 4:17,19	dollars (1) 9:18	four (1) 9:18
arguments (1) 7:21	calculate (1) 7:14	contact (1) 9:9	done (2) 9:14;11:21	Freeman (1) 5:3
arrangements (2) 4:3,20	contained (1) 4:14	controversial (1) 6:11	down (1) 9:12	Friday (1) 6:5
assessed (1) 7:25	controversial (1) 6:11	copies (2) 4:24;5:3	driver (1) 8:2	full (3) 5:15,18;10:4
assessor (1) 8:25	calculate (1) 7:14	corner (1) 11:3	E	fully (2) 7:2;9:4
assistance (3) 9:15,22,23	calculation (1) 7:7	cost (1) 7:25	economic (2) 4:12;8:23	Further (2) 4:15;12:10
attend (2) 4:21;12:5	calculations (1) 7:17	costs (7) 6:17;7:2,8,10,14,	educational (1) 10:25	G
attending (1) 12:13	call (1) 5:11	18,22	eight (1) 3:24	general (2) 4:2,10
available (2) 4:22,25	can (1) 6:25	counsel (1) 4:21	eligible (1) 10:24	Getty (1) 8:15
B	category (3) 6:10;7:6;10:25	County (9) 3:6,21,23;4:13;5:6,	Ellenville (1) 11:17	gift (4) 9:17,17,21,21
back (3) 10:16,24;11:10	Central (1) 11:17	6,7;6:22;8:24	else (2) 10:7;11:12	given (1) 8:17
background (1) 4:24	certain (1) 3:12	course (1) 4:16	end (3) 6:20;7:16;10:21	glad (1) 6:9
based (1)	certainly (1) 8:11	covered (1) 7:2	entire (1) 6:22	Good (1)
	CHAIR (15) 3:2,8;5:20;6:3,7;	Criteria (1) 3:17	estimates (1) 6:17	
	Chairman (4) 3:5;8:17,20,23	currently (1) 7:7		

3:4 go-round (1) 9:5 guys (1) 8:12	investment (1) 11:2 issue (1) 9:4 issues (1) 4:9	7:13,20 meantime (1) 10:12 Medical (1) 9:17 meeting (4) 3:22,22,25;11:4 meetings (1) 3:25 member (1) 3:9 members (2) 3:9,20 merits (1) 7:16 Michael (1) 3:4 might (1) 7:18 minutes (1) 5:13 more (2) 5:13;6:14 Morrow (1) 3:7 most (1) 9:14 much (1) 6:17 municipalities (2) 7:3;9:10 municipality (1) 6:18 myself (1) 8:4	5:4 one (5) 6:19,24;7:11;9:19; 10:18 only (1) 10:22 open (4) 4:2;5:20;10:11; 12:2 operating (1) 5:8 opportunity (3) 3:7,15;12:5 opposed (2) 8:4,4 option (1) 7:9 order (1) 4:4 out (1) 6:7	11:2 positive (1) 9:11 present (1) 4:4 presented (1) 3:20 probably (1) 9:19 problem (1) 8:18 Proceedings (10) 3:1;4:1;5:1;6:1; 7:1;8:1;9:1;10:1; 11:1;12:1 process (1) 9:12 project (4) 6:16;7:17,20;8:7 Projects (3) 3:18;7:15;8:5 promotion (1) 4:12 proposed (4) 6:16;7:15;10:19; 11:3 provide (4) 3:14;4:11;5:25; 11:20 public (16) 3:10,14,14,20;4:2, 5,7,25;5:9,14,16,18; 11:22,24;12:9,13 published (2) 5:2;12:7 purpose (4) 3:13;4:6,8,13
H	J			
hand (1) 5:10 happy (1) 11:13 hear (1) 6:3 hearing (14) 3:11,14,20;4:6,8, 16,21,25;5:15,16,21; 12:6,8,13 Hi (1) 8:22 highest (3) 7:5,9;9:19 holding (1) 3:10 hoping (1) 10:23 Horodyski (1) 3:5 hot (1) 8:11 housing (3) 10:20,24;11:6	Jim (3) 8:19,22;10:6 John (1) 3:7 jurisdictions (1) 10:2			
	K			
	keep (3) 5:12;10:11;11:25 Kirchhoff (1) 9:17 knew (1) 8:10			
	L			
	Labor (1) 3:18 landscape (1) 9:12 last (3) 6:15;9:5;12:3 least (1) 10:11 Legislator (1) 8:25 Leverett (1) 3:8 little (1) 7:10 Local (3) 3:18;4:9;9:10 look (2) 7:20;9:12 looking (1) 11:12 looks (1) 9:16 lot (1) 6:12			
	M			
	Madam (1) 10:12 MALE (1) 8:16 Maloney (4) 8:19,20,22;9:8 matrix (3) 3:17;10:20;11:2 may (2)			
I		N	P	
IDA (2) 9:3,15 idea (2) 6:24;7:13 identify (1) 5:11 incentives (1) 4:11 include (2) 11:18;12:8 individual (2) 7:17,20 Industrial (2) 3:21,23 information (1) 4:18 inputs (1) 9:10 inserted (1) 5:18 instead (3) 5:17;6:25;7:12 interested (1) 6:23 into (2) 5:18;10:24 introduce (1) 3:7		name (2) 3:4;8:22 need (1) 9:23 Neil (1) 5:22 New (7) 6:11;7:24;8:5,11; 9:5,9,14 next (2) 3:22,22 note (1) 11:15 noted (2) 12:7,14 notice (5) 4:25;5:2,4,16;12:8	Paltz (5) 6:11;7:25;8:5,11; 9:5 paper (1) 8:17 part (1) 11:23 pause (1) 10:13 pay (1) 10:4 payment (1) 7:9 payments (3) 6:18,24;7:6 pays (1) 9:18 people (2) 7:19;10:2 per (2) 9:18,19 period (1) 12:2 PILOT (7) 3:16;6:18,24,25; 7:12,12;11:19 planning (1) 4:9 please (2) 5:9;12:6 pm (5) 10:14,15;11:8,9; 12:14 podium (1) 5:10 policies (4) 3:13,19;4:7,14 Policy (5) 3:12,16,18;10:19;	
		O		Q
		objection (1) 5:17 obviously (1) 8:10 officer (1)		quick (1) 11:18 quickly (1) 10:17
				R
				raise (1) 5:10 Randall (1) 3:8 reading (1) 5:16 receipt (1) 12:2 receive (1) 11:16 received (3) 3:19;10:22;11:23 Recess (2) 10:14;11:8 record (7) 4:5;5:11,18;10:17;

<p>11:11,24;12:9 regards (1) 11:5 remember (1) 7:24 removed (1) 10:18 repopulated (1) 11:5 request (1) 5:17 response (4) 5:19;10:8;11:14; 12:11 rules (2) 5:8;11:21</p>	<p>submit (1) 3:15 submitting (1) 8:8 subsidizing (1) 6:20 sufficient (2) 4:19,23 suggest (1) 5:15 suggestions (1) 7:11 Supervisor (1) 9:6 sure (2) 7:2;8:6 synopsis (1) 11:18</p>	<p>Ulster (10) 3:5,21,23;4:12;5:5, 6;8:24;9:2,13,20 under (5) 7:5,9;10:25;11:2,3 Uniform (4) 3:12,16,17;10:19 unless (1) 5:16 up (7) 6:5,20;7:10,16;9:4, 12;10:21 UTEP (1) 10:19</p>	<p>zoning (1) 4:9</p>
S		V	1
			<p>12/5/16 (10) 3:1;4:1;5:1;6:1; 7:1;8:1;9:1;10:1; 11:1;12:1 14th (1) 3:24</p>
			2
			<p>2016 (2) 3:24;12:3</p>
			3
<p>school (3) 5:5;11:17,19 seek (1) 9:10 seems (1) 7:15 send (1) 12:6 sent (1) 5:3 short (1) 7:10 sign (1) 8:17 sit (1) 11:4 solicit (2) 3:11;4:7 somebody (1) 10:10 Sorry (1) 11:7 speak (2) 8:21;11:12 SPEAKER (1) 8:16 special (1) 10:3 specific (1) 4:13 spread (1) 6:21 square (2) 9:18,19 staff (1) 4:20 standard (3) 6:25;7:12,14 started (1) 3:3 stenographer (2) 4:4;10:12 still (2) 6:10;7:10</p>	T	<p>vacant (1) 11:3 value (2) 7:25;10:4 verbally (1) 10:22 versus (2) 6:18;7:18 Vice (1) 3:8 village (1) 5:5</p>	<p>30th (1) 12:3</p>
		W	7
	<p>table (1) 4:25 talking (1) 7:16 Tax (4) 3:12,16;4:11;10:19 taxes (1) 9:19 taxing (1) 9:25 taxpayers (2) 6:20;8:6 terms (1) 4:14 Thanks (1) 10:6 though (1) 7:24 thought (1) 7:8 three (1) 9:25 throughout (1) 6:21 today (1) 3:19 topic (2) 6:11;8:11 touchy (1) 6:15 Tourism (1) 8:23 town (6) 5:5;6:2,13;8:25; 9:13,20 Transportation (1) 8:24</p>		<p>7:02 (1) 5:21 7:07 (2) 10:11,14 7:15 (1) 10:14 7:16 (1) 11:8 7:20 (3) 10:11;11:8,11 7:21 (2) 12:13,14</p>
			9
			<p>9th (1) 6:5</p>
	U		
	<p>UCIDA (1) 11:20</p>		
		Y	
		<p>year (1) 12:4</p>	
		Z	